



## Evaluation of Planning for The Completion of Nine Years of Compulsory Basic Education

Hary Murcahyanto<sup>1✉</sup>, Mohzana<sup>2</sup>, Hartini Haritani<sup>3</sup>

Universitas Hamzanwadi, Indonesia Selong Nusa Tenggara Barat, Indonesia<sup>1,2,3</sup>

Email correspondence [harymurcahyanto@gmail.com](mailto:harymurcahyanto@gmail.com)

Received: 17-03-2024

Revised: 12-09-2024

Accepted: 02-11-2024

### Abstract

This study focuses on the evaluation of the planning of 9-year compulsory basic education in East Lombok Regency, with the main objective of assessing the effectiveness of planning oriented to minimum service standards (MSS). This education planning is considered important in addressing the gap in access to education and improving the quality of basic education at the regional level. The research hypothesis is that the proper implementation of MSS in basic education planning can significantly improve access and quality of education and reduce illiteracy rates in the region. This research method combines qualitative and quantitative approaches through in-depth interviews, observations, and documentation, involving stakeholders such as education officials, school principals, and community leaders. This study found that the planning structure and products have included an in-depth analysis and appropriate budget allocation, but budget challenges and community support are aspects that need to be improved. The discussion of the research results emphasizes the importance of involving the community more actively and strengthening cross-sectoral collaboration to optimize the planning and implementation of basic education. Overall, this study makes a significant contribution to understanding the complexity of basic education planning in the region and offers recommendations for increasing the effectiveness of SPM implementation, which can play a role in improving the quality of education and reducing educational disparities in East Lombok Regency.

**Keywords:** Education Planning Valuation, Minimum Service Standards (MSS), Education Access, Basic education quality, Cross-sector collaboration

### Abstrak

Penelitian ini berfokus pada evaluasi perencanaan pendidikan dasar wajib 9 tahun di Kabupaten Lombok Timur, dengan tujuan utama untuk menilai efektivitas perencanaan yang berorientasi pada standar pelayanan minimal (SPM). Perencanaan pendidikan ini dianggap penting dalam mengatasi kesenjangan akses pendidikan dan meningkatkan kualitas pendidikan dasar di tingkat daerah. Hipotesis penelitian adalah bahwa penerapan SPM yang tepat dalam perencanaan pendidikan dasar dapat meningkatkan akses dan kualitas pendidikan secara signifikan serta menurunkan angka buta huruf di wilayah tersebut. Metode penelitian ini menggabungkan pendekatan kualitatif dan kuantitatif melalui wawancara mendalam, observasi, dan dokumentasi, yang melibatkan pemangku kepentingan seperti pejabat pendidikan, kepala sekolah, dan tokoh masyarakat. Penelitian ini menemukan bahwa struktur dan produk perencanaan telah mencakup analisis yang mendalam dan alokasi anggaran yang sesuai, namun tantangan anggaran dan dukungan masyarakat menjadi aspek yang perlu ditingkatkan. Diskusi hasil penelitian menekankan pentingnya melibatkan komunitas secara lebih aktif dan memperkuat kolaborasi lintas sektoral guna mengoptimalkan perencanaan dan pelaksanaan pendidikan

dasar. Secara keseluruhan, penelitian ini memberikan kontribusi signifikan dalam memahami kompleksitas perencanaan pendidikan dasar di daerah serta menawarkan rekomendasi untuk peningkatan efektivitas pelaksanaan SPM, yang dapat berperan dalam meningkatkan mutu pendidikan dan mengurangi kesenjangan pendidikan di Kabupaten Lombok Timur.

**Kata Kunci:** Penilaian Perencanaan Pendidikan, Standar Pelayanan Minimal (SPM), Akses Pendidikan, Kualitas Pendidikan Dasar, Kolaborasi Lintas Sektor

## INTRODUCTION

In the framework of nation-building, the development of human resources plays a determining role.<sup>1</sup> The success of nation-building in East Asian countries is an example of success based on the development of human resources (human resources-based economic development strategy).<sup>2</sup> Education is at the core of every human resource development. The quantity and quality of human resources will be determined by the availability and quality of education.<sup>3</sup> Therefore, the existence of quality educational institutions is an absolute requirement in every development. One of the crucial roles of education in the development of East Asian countries is realizing what is referred to as the critical mass in the field of Education.<sup>4</sup> This concept strives for a certain percentage of the population with a specific level of education that a nation must prepare to accelerate development.<sup>5</sup> In implementing development in the field of education, the government has established policies based on: (1) equalization and expansion of access, (2) improvement of quality, relevance, and competitiveness, and (3) strengthening governance, accountability, and public image. One manifestation of these policies is that development at the primary education level (Elementary School/Madrasah Ibtidaiyah,

---

<sup>1</sup> Ari Kartiko and Jaya Roza Azzukhrufi, 'Pengaruh Budaya Organisasi Dan Kompensasi Terhadap Kinerja Pendidik Di Madrasah Aliyah Nahdlatul Ulama Mazro'atul Ulum Paciran', *Nidhomul Haq: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam* 4, no. 2 (5 September 2019): 207–26, <https://doi.org/10.31538/ndh.v4i2.351>.

<sup>2</sup> Dian-Fu Chang, Wen-Ching Chou, and Tien-Li Chen, 'Comparing Gender Diversity in the Process of Higher-Education Expansion in Japan, Korea, Taiwan, and the UK for SDG 5', *Sustainability* 14, no. 17 (January 2022): 5, <https://doi.org/10.3390/su141710929>; Aldona Malgorzata Dereń and Jan Skonieczny, 'Green Intellectual Property as a Strategic Resource in the Sustainable Development of an Organization', *Sustainability* 14, no. 8 (January 2022): 4758, <https://doi.org/10.3390/su14084758>; Ari Kartiko et al., 'Improving Teacher Job Satisfaction Through Organizational Commitment and Organizational Citizenship Behavior in The Digitalization Era', *Nidhomul Haq: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam* 8, no. 2 (15 October 2023): 315–27, <https://doi.org/10.31538/ndh.v8i2.3960>.

<sup>3</sup> Jumiaty Jumiaty and Ari Kartiko, 'Pengaruh Self Efficacy Dan Locus of Control Terhadap Kinerja Guru', *Academicus: Journal of Teaching and Learning* 1, no. 1 (27 September 2022): 32–44, <https://doi.org/10.59373/academicus.v1i1.5>.

<sup>4</sup> Eduardo Encabo-Fernández, Domingo Albarracín-Vivo, and Isabel Jerez-Martínez, 'Evaluative Research on the Critical Thinking of Primary School Students', *International Journal of Educational Research Open* 4 (1 January 2023): 100249, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedro.2023.100249>; Kendall D. Funk, Hannah L. Paul, and Andrew Q. Philips, 'Point Break: Using Machine Learning to Uncover a Critical Mass in Women's Representation', *Political Science Research and Methods* 10, no. 2 (April 2022): 372–90, <https://doi.org/10.1017/psrm.2021.51>; Carolina Nicolás-Castellano et al., 'Sustainable Change in Primary Science Education: From Transmissive to Guided Inquiry-Based Teaching', *Sustainability* 15, no. 15 (January 2023): 11710, <https://doi.org/10.3390/su151511710>; Juuso Henrik Nieminen, 'Assessment for Inclusion: Rethinking Inclusive Assessment in Higher Education', *Teaching in Higher Education* 29, no. 4 (18 May 2024): 841–59, <https://doi.org/10.1080/13562517.2021.2021395>.

<sup>5</sup> Ian M. Kinchin, 'The Salutogenic Management of Pedagogic Frailty: A Case of Educational Theory Development Using Concept Mapping', *Education Sciences* 9, no. 2 (June 2019): 157, <https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci9020157>; Chatthida Yukhong et al., 'Socialization Concepts and Educational Management Development to Create Muslim Citizenship through Private Islamic Schools in the Southern Border Provinces of Thailand', *International Journal of Islamic Thought* 15 (13 June 2019): 27–34, <https://doi.org/10.24035/ijit.15.2019.003>.

and Junior High School/Madrasah Tsanawiyah) emphasizes the expansion of educational equalization without neglecting the improvement of educational quality.<sup>6</sup> This policy is implemented by enforcing compulsory education for nine years. The Compulsory Education for Nine Years consists of the age group of 7-12 years at the Elementary School/Madrasah Ibtidaiyah level and the age group of 13-15 years at the Junior High School/Madrasah Tsanawiyah level.<sup>7</sup>

The compulsory nine-year basic education (1) is a government policy introduced on May 2, 1994, (2) was supposed to be completed by the end of 2008/2009 with a minimum Gross Enrollment Ratio for Junior High School/Madrasah Tsanawiyah of 90%, (3) has been mandated in Presidential Instruction Number 5 of 2006 concerning the National Movement for Accelerating the Completion of Compulsory Nine-Year Basic Education and Eradicating Illiteracy, and (4) compulsory education at the Elementary School/Madrasah Ibtidaiyah level nationwide has been declared successful with a Gross Enrollment Ratio achievement exceeding 100%.<sup>8</sup> Since the compulsory nine-year basic education program was initiated, thousands of classrooms have been built, including new building units and additional classrooms in existing schools. Likewise, efforts to enhance the quality of education have been and will continue to be implemented continuously and sustainably.<sup>9</sup> Various efforts have been made, including expanding educational facilities, improving the quality of teachers through various training programs, providing various incentives for teachers to enhance their performance, and enhancing the quality of school principals and supervisors.<sup>10</sup>

Theoretically, it can be estimated that compulsory nine-year basic education will increasingly face more significant challenges over time, as the target group becomes increasingly dominated by hard-core targets, which are difficult to reach. These difficulties primarily stem from the fact that the target conditions present various severe problems, including geographical, transportation, social, cultural, and economic challenges. Until now, these problems have not

---

<sup>6</sup> Kiki Hibatulloh, 'The Ethics of Islamic Religious Education Teachers According to KH. Hasyim Asy'ari and Their Relevance to Improving the Quality of Islamic Education in Indonesia', *LECTURES: Journal of Islamic and Education Studies* 1, no. 1 (12 December 2022): 1–9, <https://doi.org/10.58355/lectures.v1i1.12>; Bambang Karsono, Robertus Suraji, and Istianingsih Sastrodiharjo, 'The Influence of Leadership Spirituality to Improving the Quality of Higher Education in Indonesia', *International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities Invention* 9, no. 02 (22 February 2022): 6832–41, <https://doi.org/10.18535/ijsshi/v9i02.06>.

<sup>7</sup> Lia Amalia and Endah D. A. Anantisari, 'Evaluation of 9-Year Compulsory Basic Education Learning Program in Serang Banten', *Journal of Physics: Conference Series* 1477, no. 4 (March 2020): 042072, <https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1477/4/042072>.

<sup>8</sup> Gunawan Gunawan, Muhammad Adyan Simanjuntak, and Siti Marisa, 'Compulsory Education Phenomenon for Islamic Education in Indonesia', *ALAdzkiya International of Education and Sosial (AIoES) Journal* 3, no. 1 (16 April 2022): 10–17, <https://doi.org/10.55311/aioes.v3i1.183>.

<sup>9</sup> Imron Fauzi and Ari Kartiko, 'Pengaruh Promosi an Produk Terhadap Pengambilan Keputusan Memilih Madrasah', *Munaddhomah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam* 4, no. 2 (15 April 2023): 242–51, <https://doi.org/10.31538/munaddhomah.v4i2.435>; Neti Karnati, 'Implementation Strategy of 9-Year Compulsory Basic Education Policy In Serang Banten', 2020, [https://www.academia.edu/61857625/Implementation\\_Strategy\\_of\\_9\\_Year\\_Compulsory\\_Basic\\_Education\\_Policy\\_In\\_Serang\\_Banten?auto=download](https://www.academia.edu/61857625/Implementation_Strategy_of_9_Year_Compulsory_Basic_Education_Policy_In_Serang_Banten?auto=download).

<sup>10</sup> Martha Motshaki Mamabolo, Khashane Stephen Malatji, and Lydia Kgomotso Mphahlele, 'The Role of Supervisors in the Implementation of the Integrated Quality Management System in Schools', *South African Journal of Education* 42, no. 1 (28 February 2022): 1–9, <https://doi.org/10.15700/saje.v42n1a2019>; Susana Siti Riani and Siti Quratul Ain, 'The Role of School Principal in Implementing Education Quality Management', *Jurnal Ilmiah Sekolah Dasar* 6, no. 2 (4 June 2022): 204–11, <https://doi.org/10.23887/jisd.v6i2.45216>.

been thoroughly identified.<sup>11</sup> The movement to complete the compulsory nine-year basic education, specifically providing opportunities and encouraging children aged 13-15 to attend Junior High School/Madrasah Tsanawiyah, entails the establishment of coordination teams at the district level. This initiative is a result of the implementation of Law Number 32 of 2004 concerning Regional Governance. The coordination team comprises the Regent as the chairperson, the Head of the Department of Education and Culture as the daily chairperson, the Head of the Department of Religion as the deputy daily chairperson, and leaders of relevant departments and non-departmental institutions as members.<sup>12</sup>

The success of the Nine-Year Compulsory Education Coordination Team depends on thorough planning. The planning aspect plays a crucial role in allocating and managing resources for the educational process and overseeing it. Weaknesses in planning can result in the misallocation of resources and educational processes, leading to the failure of educational programs to achieve their set goals. To gauge the performance of regional governments in implementing Mandatory Authority, including the Nine-Year Compulsory Education, the Minister of National Education issues Ministerial Decisions and National Education Standards<sup>13</sup>. This study focuses on evaluating the planning for completing the nine-year compulsory basic education in East Lombok Regency, centered on minimum service standards. Its aim is to understand the context, input, process, outcomes, and effectiveness of the planning process.

## METHOD

This research uses mixed methods research or mixed methods, which is a research approach that combines elements of quantitative and qualitative research in one study to understand a phenomenon more deeply and comprehensively.<sup>14</sup> The use of mixed methods aims to overcome the limitations of each method when applied separately and to increase the validity and reliability of research results. The study focuses on the department of religion in the field of madrasa education of East Lombok Regency and utilizes three data collection techniques: interviews, observations, and documentation. Interviews follow an unstructured qualitative interview approach, conducted openly, and treat the informants as research peers.

---

<sup>11</sup> Amalia and Anantisari, 'Evaluation of 9-Year Compulsory Basic Education Learning Program in Serang Banten'; Mohammed Qasserras, 'Character and Peacebuilding in Islamic Pedagogy, "Tazkiyah" and "Taaruf" Concepts as A Case Study', *At-Tadzkir: Islamic Education Journal* 3, no. 1 (25 February 2024): 26–34, <https://doi.org/10.59373/attadzkir.v3i1.50>.

<sup>12</sup> Maulana Mukhlis, Feni Rosalia, and M. Arif Kurniawan, 'Transfer of Management Authority Policy: A Difficult Path to Educational Decentralization Effectiveness (A Case Study in Pesisir Barat Regency, Lampung Province)', *International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities Invention* 9, no. 05 (20 May 2022): 7031–41, <https://doi.org/10.18535/ijsshi/v9i05.05>; Fajry Fajry, Saipul Annur, and Tutut Handayani, 'Strategi Promosi Prodi Pendidikan Sendratasik Dalam Meningkatkan Jumlah Mahasiswa', *Munaddhomah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam* 5, no. 1 (2024): 51–60, <https://doi.org/10.31538/munaddhomah.v5i1.728>.

<sup>13</sup> Rupiarsieh, '9 Year Compulsory Education Evaluation In Bojonegoro Regency, East Java Province, Indonesia. Year 2015', *Advances in Social Sciences Research Journal* 6, no. 3 (14 March 2019): 39–49, <https://doi.org/10.14738/assrj.63.6280>.

<sup>14</sup> J. W. Creswell and A. L. Garrett, 'The "Movement" of Mixed Methods Research and the Role of Educators', *South African Journal of Education* 28, no. 3 (2008): 321–33, <https://doi.org/10.15700/saje.v28n3a176>; N. J. Dewasiri, Y. K. B. Weerakoon, and A. A. Azeez, 'Mixed Methods in Finance Research: The Rationale and Research Designs', *International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 17, no. 1 (1 December 2018): 1609406918801730, <https://doi.org/10.1177/1609406918801730>.

The interview guidelines are open-ended, allowing respondents to provide free-form answers to the questions posed.

In data collection, interviews were conducted using a semi-structured interview model, which allows researchers to ask main questions while being flexible in exploring participants' answers in depth. This interview was aimed at parties directly involved in the planning and implementation of nine-year compulsory basic education, such as education office officials, school principals, teachers, and possibly school committee members. Interview evidence can be shown through interview transcripts or relevant brief notes. Meanwhile, observation techniques were carried out using a non-participant observation model. Researchers observed the planning and implementation process of compulsory basic education programs without being directly involved in the activities observed, to maintain objectivity. This observation can include monitoring activities carried out by the education office and schools in preparing programs, as well as in their implementation in the field. Observation evidence can be in the form of field notes or photos that support observations.

Data validation in this study is necessary to meet credibility standards, involving several techniques such as continuous observation for 4-6 months, method and data source triangulation, involving peers in discussing research findings and analyzing negative cases that may refute research findings.<sup>15</sup> The data analysis techniques used in this study include qualitative and quantitative analysis. In qualitative analysis, an inductive analysis approach is used, starting from facts towards higher levels of abstraction, including synthesis and theory development. The data analysis steps involve data reduction to simplify, abstract, and transform field data into basic concepts, presenting data in the form of sentences or paragraphs, and drawing conclusions by comparing initial and final conditions of the aspects under investigation.<sup>16</sup>

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

### Findings

#### **Context (Purpose) for preparing plans for completing 9 years of compulsory basic education that is oriented towards minimum service standards**

This planning program aims to enforce Presidential Instruction No. 5 of 2006, focusing on increasing the percentage of students at various education levels and reducing the illiteracy rate. The planning document targets improving access and equitable quality basic education for children aged 7-15 years. However, interviews with the Head of the Education Planning Task Force in East Lombok Regency revealed that there are still 9,434 children out of school due to economic issues and lack of access. Dropouts and class repetitions are also problems, while community awareness and participation vary. Other challenges include a shortage of educational facilities and suboptimal contributions from non-formal education.

---

<sup>15</sup> Sugiyono, *Metode penelitian pendidikan: (pendekatan kuantitatif, kualitatif dan R & D)* (Alfabeta, 2008).

<sup>16</sup> Matthew B. Miles, A. Michael Huberman, and Johnny Saldana, *Qualitative Data Analysis: A Methods Sourcebook* (SAGE Publications, 2013).

### **Input for planning the completion of compulsory education 9 years of basic education oriented towards minimum service standards**

This team selected the Minimum Service Standards through workshops involving diverse stakeholders. These standards encompass the 9-year basic education service, primarily for Primary Schools/Madrasah Ibtidaiyah and Junior High Schools/Madrasah Tsanawiyah. The standards were established with the involvement of the 9-Year Basic Education Coordination Team of the District, provincial representatives, Education Council, School Committees, and Islamic Boarding Schools.

The standards utilize indicators such as Gross Enrollment Ratio and Net Enrollment Ratio, with target participation percentages set for specific years. For instance, for the year 2008/2009, the target for Gross Enrollment Ratio and Net Enrollment Ratio for Primary Schools/Madrasah Ibtidaiyah was set at 95% and 110%, respectively, while for Junior High Schools/Madrasah Tsanawiyah, it was 90% for both indicators.

### **The process of preparing plans for completing 9 years of compulsory basic education that is oriented towards minimum service standards**

One of the objectives of the Decentralized Basic Education Project (DBEP) is to facilitate the 9-Year Basic Education Coordination Team in developing a plan to complete compulsory basic education oriented towards minimum service standards. DBEP places special emphasis on the process compared to the product. Recognizing the importance of the process over the product, coaching and mentoring on all aspects of management by the 9-Year Basic Education Coordination Team are emphasized through proper processes. All consultants understand this, so their presence is key in every activity. This is also emphasized by the Head of the DBEP Project Section in East Lombok Regency, stating that:

*“The project secretary emphasizes the importance of the correct process in implementing educational management at the district level. DBEP assesses based on the concept: correct process, wrong result can still be understood; wrong process, right result, stakeholder participation evaluation is required; both process and result are wrong, DBEP reviews its assistance related to completing compulsory basic education for 9 years; the highest expectation is the correct process and result, in line with participatory management involving as many stakeholders as possible.”* (January, 2023)

When asked about the planning process conducted by the compulsory basic education for 9 years coordination team, the Secretary of DBEP East Lombok Regency stated:

*“Based on the report from Team Package 3, the process of drafting the compulsory basic education for 9 years completion planning is deemed fairly adequate, although there is still room for improvement due to time constraints. The socialization of the compulsory education coordination team, related sub-districts in the Education Office, and other stakeholders has not been optimal. The involvement of relevant parties is still limited. Therefore, in the future, efforts will be made to ensure that each stage of planning is carried out correctly by involving stakeholders, with principles of transparency and accountability not only in planning but also in all management components.”* (January, 2023)

The qualitative data obtained by the researcher regarding the process of drafting the compulsory basic education for 9 years completion planning, from the Head of the Program

Development Sub-Division, the 9-Year Compulsory Basic Education Coordination Team, the Education Council, and Education Supervisors, including from the consultants, provided similar responses. They indicated that the regency had conducted the process of drafting the compulsory basic education for 9 years of completion planning correctly, although it was not yet optimal. The Head of the Program Development Sub-Division expressed that:

*“In the planning process, we have made efforts to involve all parties, including the 9-Year Compulsory Basic Education Coordination Team, stakeholders, and the Education sector. We are aware that it is not possible to complete planning alone in a short time; therefore, we formed a team comprising all these elements with clear task assignments from the outset. However, despite our efforts, some activities could not be carried out due to time constraints, and not all aspirations could be accommodated in this planning process.”* (February 2023)

The statement from the Head of the Program Development Subdivision can be endorsed by the Chairman of the Education Council, who is also a member of the Mandatory Basic Education Planning Completion Team for 9 Years. According to him:

*“In the preparation of the planning for completing the mandatory 9-year basic education, we were actively involved. The Head of the Program Development Subdivision led this process by frequently convening the team to finalize the planning, assigning tasks, and setting times to comprehensively discuss it. As the Education Council, we were actively engaged in the process, although not involving all members.”* (March, 2023)

The acknowledgement by the Education Council Chair, who also serves as one of the members of the Planning Team for the completion of mandatory 9-year basic education, as stated above, is corroborated by one of the members of the planning team for the completion of mandatory 9-year basic education, who is also appointed as the program quality improvement supervisor, stating:

*“In the preparation of the plan for completing the mandatory 9-year basic education, we were actively involved by the Sub-section Chief of Program Development, and I was even appointed as the responsible person for quality improvement activities. The planning process involved frequent meetings, often lasting from late afternoon until evening, initiated by the Sub-section Chief of Program Development. The team showed high enthusiasm with their attendance at every meeting. Some of us, including myself, were directly assigned tasks, while other team members were asked to participate in written form, which was then processed by the team.”* (FID March, 2023)

The same sentiment was also expressed by Package 2 Consultant, serving as the Education Management Specialist, stating that:

*“The preparation of the Basic Education Completion Plan for 9 Years in East Lombok Regency was carried out by a team consisting of various elements, including the Education Council and the 9-Year Basic Education Compulsory Coordination Team. They were transparently and actively involved in the planning task, although this might be a first-time experience for some of them. From the reports received, they often worked late into the night, while we only accompanied them in the mornings to evaluate progress and discuss next steps.”* (FID April, 2023)

Based on the data presented above, which has been validated through triangulation both with data sources (informants) and observations of their actions, it can be concluded that DBEP, through its activities such as socialization/assignments, training, mentoring, and review by consultant teams, has ensured that the process of drafting the plan to complete the compulsory 9-year basic education has been carried out following the correct procedures, implementing the principles developed, including the involvement of school/community stakeholders, planning sources, and decision-making processes.

### **The product of preparing plans for completing 9 years of compulsory basic education that is oriented towards minimum service standards**

In 2006, the population aged 7-12 years in East Lombok Regency was 142,641 people, with 130,430 people in elementary schools (SD/MI) and Equivalent Package A. There were 827 elementary schools (655 SD and 172 MI), with a total of 152,279 students. The number of classes in elementary schools reached 4,506 with 4,084 classrooms, and in MI there were 877 classes with 816 classrooms. The number of elementary school teachers was 6,383, with qualifications ranging from junior high school, high school (teaching), high school (non-teaching), PGSLP/D.I, PGSLA/D.II, Bachelor/D.III, and Bachelor's degree. The percentage of qualified teachers according to qualifications, with a minimum of a bachelor's degree for elementary schools, was 44.63% for elementary schools and 37.51% for MI.

In the age group of 13-15 years, the population was 80,686 people, with 47,660 people in junior high schools (SMP-MTs) and Equivalent Package B. The regency had 249 junior high schools (70 SMP and 179 MTs), with a total of 62,440 junior high school equivalent students. The number of classes in SMP and MTs were 714 and 819 respectively, with available classrooms. The number of junior high school teachers in East Lombok Regency was 1,816, with qualifications ranging from high school to bachelor's degree. The percentage of qualified teachers according to qualifications, with a minimum of a bachelor's degree for SMP-MTs, was 63.44% for SMP and 31.61% for MTs.

After interventions through socialization/assignments, training/workshops, mentoring, and review, the product (result) of drafting the plan to complete compulsory 9-year basic education oriented towards minimal service standards in East Lombok Regency, made by the Wajar Dikdas 9-year coordination team, was quite significant, namely: (1) clear form, utility, and systematics, (2) appropriate analysis used, (3) clear policies, programs, and activities, (4) appropriate budget allocation, and (5) implications of implementing minimal service standards accordingly.

### **Effectiveness of planning for completing 9 years of compulsory basic education that is oriented towards minimum service standards**

To find out the effectiveness of planning for the normal completion of 9 years of primary education is to compare the current educational conditions and the expected conditions based on indicators and minimum service standards as shown in Tables 1 and 2 below:



Table 1. Current and Expected Education Conditions Based on Indicators and Minimum Service Standards in Primary School

Numb	Indicator	Expected educational conditions and targets for 5 years					
		2003/2004	2004/2005	2005/2006	2006/2007	2007/2008	2008/2009
1	Primary School/Madrasah Ibtida'iyah/Package A						
	a. Increasing and expanding access to education						
	1) GPF	103.05%	104.68%	105.32%	106.76%	108.43%	110%
	2) PFF	89.37%	90.10%	90.88%	91.43%	93.79%	95%
	3) OPF	93.72%	94.35%	95.87%	97.39%	98.12%	100%
	4) S/SR	191	199	200	202	230	240
	5) S/TR	31	31	25	21	30	30
	6) S/CR	28	30	35	29	40	40
	7) C/CR	1.15	1.12	1.11	1.10	1.07	1.00
	8) Number of children aged 7-12 years who are not in school	Reduced 10%	Reduced 20%	Reduced 20%	Reduced 50%	Reduced 50%	0
	b. Increasing the quality of competitiveness						
	1) DO	0.84%	0.75%	0.60%	0.44%	0.40%	0.30%
	2) NR	7.11%	7.00%	6.98%	6.94%	5.00%	0%
	3) NG	89.6%	91.68%	93.76%	95.00%	97.92%	100%
	4) ETT	50.30%	58.24%	66.18%	75.43%	82.06%	90%
	5) SCR	83.90%	84.11%	85.58%	86.77%	87.53%	90%
	6) NUS	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase
	7) Participation in various competitions	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase
	c. Strengthening, governance, accountability and public image						
	1) Community participation	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase
	2) Appointment of officials (school principals)	Profesional	Profesional	Profesional	Profesional	Profesional	Profesional
	3) Coordination and synchronization of school management	Not Enough	Enough	Good	Good	Very Good	Very Good
	4) Management transparency	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase
	5) Data collection system	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase
	6) Management unit functions	Enough	Good	Good	Good	Very Good	Very Good
	7) Implementation	Enough	Good	Good	Good	Very Good	Very Good

## Evaluation of Planning for The Completion of Nine Years of Compulsory Basic Education

8) Empowerment of supervisors	Enough	Good	Good	Good	Very Good	Very Good
9) Implementation of monitoring and evaluation	Enough	Good	Good	Good	Very Good	Very Good
10) Socialization/publication	Enough	Good	Good	Good	Very Good	Very Good

Table 2. Current and Expected Education Conditions Based on Indicators and Minimum Service Standards in Junior High School

Numb	Indicator	Expected educational conditions and targets for 5 years					
		2003/2004	2004/2005	2005/2006	2006/2007	2007/2008	
2	Junior High School / Madrasah Tsanawiyah / Package B						
	a. Increasing and expanding access to education						
	1) GPF	74.49%	75.86%	76.33%	77.38%	86.46%	90%
	2) PFF	54.95%	59.62%	60.23%	61.99%	74.75%	90%
	3) OPF	73.09%	75.66%	78.22%	80.15%	83.25%	90%
	4) S/SR	225	252	337	398	360	360
	5) S/TR	44	40	38	15	21	21
	6) S/CR	31	32	35	38	39	40
	7) C/CR	1.42	1.34	1.25	1.06	1.08	1.00
	8) Number of children aged 13-15 years who do not attend school	Reduced 10%	Reduced 20%	Reduced 20%	Reduced 50%	Reduced 50%	0
	b. Increasing the quality of competitiveness						
	1) DO	5.62%	4.70%	4.00%	3.80%	2.50%	1%
	2) NR	0.48%	0.38%	0.29%	0.69%	0.10%	0%
	3) NG	98.50%	98.80%	99.10%	99.45%	99.70%	100%
	4) ETT	64.00%	68.28%	75.88%	80.22%	85.65%	90%
	5) SCR	77.64%	80.11%	82.58%	85.32%	87.11%	90%
	6) NUS	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase
	7) Participation in various competitions	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase
	c. Strengthening, governance, accountability and public image						
	1) Community participation	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase
	2) Appointment of officials (school principals)	Profesional	Profesional	Profesional	Profesional	Profesional	Profesional

3) Coordination and synchronization of school management	Not Enough	Enough	Good	Good	Very Good	Very Good
4) Management transparency	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase
5) Data collection system	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase	Increase
6) Management unit functions	Enough	Good	Good	Good	Very Good	Very Good
7) Implementation	Enough	Good	Good	Good	Very Good	Very Good
8) Empowerment of supervisors	Enough	Good	Good	Good	Very Good	Very Good
9) Implementation of monitoring and evaluation	Enough	Good	Good	Good	Very Good	Very Good
10) Socialization/publication	Enough	Good	Good	Good	Very Good	Very Good

Information:

GPF = Gross Participation Figures

PPF = Pure participation figures

OPF = Overall participation figures

S/SR = Student/school ratio

S/TR = Student/Teacher ratio.

S/CR = Student/class ratio.

C/CR = Classroom/classroom ratio

DO= Drop Out

NR = The number of repeats

NG = Graduate numbers

ETT = Eligibility of teachers to teach

SCR = school completion rate

**Discussion**

**Context (Purpose) for preparing plans for completing 9 years of compulsory basic education that is oriented towards minimum service standards**

The plan to complete the compulsory 9-year basic education in East Lombok Regency is based on accurate information from situation and capacity analysis. The program's goal is to improve access and equitable provision of high-quality and affordable basic education services. The program targets all children aged 7-15 years to attain at least a junior high school education. However, there are still 9,434 children who are not attending school, mainly due to poverty and distant school access. This program also includes capacity development for the Coordination Team and the Education Office to respond to the challenges of reform and regional autonomy.

The plan aims to increase the percentage of students in primary and secondary schools and reduce the illiteracy rate. This process considers synergy among stakeholders, supports

relevant local regulations and enhances the professionalism of administrative personnel. With a focus on minimal service standards, the program is expected to achieve its goals by the end of 2008 and 2009.

The completion of nine years of compulsory education in East Lombok Regency is in line with the theory of educational planning and the concept of compulsory education, especially in terms of access, equity, and quality of education. As following the theory of social justice in education, According to the theory of social justice, access to education should be available to all children, especially those who are vulnerable to inequality, such as children from poor families or those who live far from educational facilities. The program's target of increasing access and equity of quality education services for children aged 7-15 years is following this principle, as well as addressing the inequality that children in remote areas often face. John Rawls is a major figure in the theory of social justice. Rawls in his work "A Theory of Justice" put forward the concept of distributive justice which is relevant in the context of equal access to education, especially for vulnerable groups.<sup>17</sup>

### **Input for planning the completion of compulsory education 9 years of basic education oriented towards minimum service standards**

Regency relies heavily on financial input, particularly education budgeting. Since the implementation of Regional Autonomy in 2001, local financial management has shifted from centralization to decentralization. Although General Allocation Fund (DAU) and Equalization Fund assist as local financial sources, there are limitations in funds to meet all needs, especially in education. The new system of local financial management, emphasizing performance budgeting and accountability, requires understanding and enhancement of both technical and non-technical personnel capabilities.

The Education Office faces budget constraints, especially for basic education, despite the allocation of a significant portion of the education budget in the 2007 Regional Budget. Additionally, limited community participation and high costs of basic education pose challenges. Nevertheless, the Coordination Team for the 9-Year Basic Education has estimated the budget required to achieve minimal service standards, adjusting its tasks in implementing the planning accordingly.

The above analysis is largely in line with the theory of regional financial decentralization and performance-based budget management. In the theory of decentralization, as explained by public finance experts, granting financial autonomy to regional governments aims to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of budget allocation, including in the field of education. Decentralization allows regions to be more responsive to their specific needs and more accountable in financial management.

From the explanation above, it can be seen that decentralization in regional financial management through the Regional Autonomy policy seeks to give greater authority to regional governments, including in education budgeting. However, despite the support of the General

---

<sup>17</sup> Ene Eryılmaz, 'A critical assessment of John Rawls's Theory of Justice as fairness', 2019, <https://open.metu.edu.tr/handle/11511/43642>; Ülker Yükselbaba, 'Can Rawls' Theory of Distributive Justice Become a Cure for Poverty?', *Annales de La Faculté de Droit d'Istanbul*, no. 71 (31 December 2022): 539–65, <https://doi.org/10.26650/annaes.2022.71.0010>.

Allocation Fund (DAU) and the Balancing Fund, funding challenges are still significant, especially for basic education. The obstacles faced by the Education Office, including budget limitations even though they have been allocated in the APBD, the high cost of basic education, and minimal community participation, indicate the need for more efficient management and increased human resource capacity in performance-based budget management.

Actions that can be taken to address this through Human Resources Training and Development, this section Strengthens the technical and non-technical competencies of personnel related to performance-based budgeting. Partnerships with Third Parties, namely Involving the private sector or non-profit institutions to increase funding and Development of Alternative Financing Models, namely by Finding creative solutions for more affordable basic education financing. Collaborative and participatory planning can also help overcome some of these challenges, so that the budget is more targeted and involves various stakeholders.<sup>18</sup>

However, this theory also recognizes that without adequate human resource capacity, both in technical and managerial skills, decentralization may not be optimal.<sup>19</sup> In addition, limited local funding sources are often the main obstacle in achieving the goal of full autonomy, in accordance with the reality faced in many regions, including those mentioned above. So, the situation faced by the Education Office in the region in this example does not reject the theory, but rather emphasizes the challenging aspects in implementing the theory of decentralization and performance-based budgeting, especially in regions with limited resources.

### **The process of preparing plans for completing 9 years of compulsory basic education that is oriented towards minimum service standards**

The preparation of the plan to complete the mandatory 9-year basic education in East Lombok Regency is carried out by the Coordination Team for Basic Education, established by the Regent. This team consists of various components, such as the Regional Development Planning Agency, Sub-Divisions within the Department of Education and Culture, and the Department of Religious Affairs. The preparation process is based on the principles of participation, transparency, and accountability. Participation is involved from various parties to ensure comprehensive and representative decisions. The principle of transparency is highly upheld as a public right, helping to build public trust in the Department of Education and Culture. Accountability is essential, where the regency is obliged to be accountable for the provision of education to the public.

The main goals involve increasing contributions, empowering stakeholders, a more active role, reflecting stakeholders' aspirations, and making these aspirations a guide. These principles are realized through various programs, including ground rules on the accountability system, behavioral guidelines, school performance monitoring systems, and performance

---

<sup>18</sup> Anwar Ma'rufi et al., 'Burhani Epistemology in The Scientific Development of Contemporary Pesantren', *Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education* 5, no. 2 (21 April 2024): 301–14, <https://doi.org/10.31538/tijie.v5i2.937>; Miftachul Huda et al., 'Islamic Religious Education Learning Media in the Technology Era: A Systematic Literature Review', *At-Tadzkir: Islamic Education Journal* 3, no. 2 (7 June 2024): 83–103, <https://doi.org/10.59373/attadzkir.v3i2.62>.

<sup>19</sup> Mykola Pasichnyi et al., 'The Impact of Fiscal Decentralization on Economic Development', SSRN Scholarly Paper (Rochester, NY: Social Science Research Network, 11 July 2019), <https://papers.ssrn.com/abstract=3430955>.

measurement with clear indicators.<sup>20</sup> The success of implementing these principles is measured by the increase in public trust, public awareness of the right to access education, and the alignment of educational activities with community values and norms.

### **The product of preparing plans for completing 9 years of compulsory basic education that is oriented towards minimum service standards**

The planning for the completion of mandatory 9-year basic education in East Lombok Regency is carried out with a focus on enhancing the regency's capacity to support the implementation of Minimum Service Standards in education management. Success indicators in implementing minimum service standards include input, process, results, benefits, and impacts.

The regency has the responsibility to formulate plans for completing the mandatory 9-year basic education as one of the delegated aspects. This planning involves creating a plan based on minimum service standards, which includes vision, mission, and objectives. The regency is empowered to plan according to its needs, especially to enhance the quality of education. The planning format has been structured according to the established guidelines. This planning document includes an introduction, profile and issues of basic education, plans and programs for Basic Education Coordination, as well as monitoring and evaluation sections.<sup>21</sup> The regency must have a vision, mission, and objectives to be achieved within a period of 3-4 years, and formulate targets with specific, measurable, and clear indicators.

Identifying the necessary functions to achieve the targets is an integral part of the planning process. The regency conducts a SWOT analysis to assess the readiness level of each required function. Issues and weaknesses are addressed through problem-solving steps determined based on the SWOT analysis. The planning also includes plans and programs for Basic Education Coordination that detail quality aspects, activities to be carried out, implementation, timing, location, and required budget. The steps taken in planning follow the guidelines of the National Institute of Public Administration (LAN) & the Supreme Audit Agency, including determining the vision, environmental analysis, supporting factor analysis, and creating a feedback system to measure implementation effectiveness.

Each weakness identified through the SWOT analysis is addressed with specific problem-solving steps. This approach ensures that planning focuses not only on program development but also on managing existing constraints. Problem-solving strategies based on SWOT findings will help districts optimize resources effectively. Basic education plans and programs include aspects of quality, activities to be implemented, implementation time,

---

<sup>20</sup> Musdalifah Alwi and Lusia Mumtahana, 'The Principal's Strategy in Improving the Quality of Teacher Performance in the Learning Process in Islamic Elementary Schools', *Kharisma: Jurnal Administrasi Dan Manajemen Pendidikan* 2, no. 1 (17 April 2023): 66–78, <https://doi.org/10.59373/kharisma.v2i1.18>; Cahyadi Kurniawan, Ulung Pribadi, and Muhammad Iqbal, 'The Role of E-Governance in Improving Local Governments Performance (Case Study: Sumbawa Regency)', *Jurnal Ilmiah Peuradeun* 11, no. 3 (30 September 2023): 1139–54, <https://doi.org/10.26811/peuradeun.v11i3.795>.

<sup>21</sup> Zainul Arifin et al., 'An Innovation in Planning Management for Learning Arabic at Islamic Boarding Schools', *Nidhomul Haq: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam* 8, no. 1 (4 March 2023): 77–89, <https://doi.org/10.31538/ndh.v8i1.3237>.

location, and budget.<sup>22</sup> This approach provides clear guidance on program implementation and reduces potential uncertainty in implementation. The existence of this detailed plan also facilitates evaluation and monitoring of the achievement of objectives.<sup>23</sup> By following the guidelines of the State Administration Institute (LAN) and the Audit Board of Indonesia (BPK), this planning is expected to achieve a high level of conformity with national standards. The planning process that includes vision setting, environmental analysis, supporting factor analysis, and feedback mechanisms also helps in maintaining the relevance of the program to actual conditions and community needs.

Several researchers have stated that this is not in line with the theory and practice of implementing public policy in the field of education, regional education management, and the effectiveness of SPM at the local level<sup>24</sup>. Dan<sup>25</sup> examines policy implementation models and the gap between theory and practice in public policy management.

### **Effectiveness of planning for completing 9 years of compulsory basic education that is oriented towards minimum service standards**

The policy of mandatory 9-year education becomes one of the crucial aspects in the effectiveness of education management at the national level and must receive support from all parties, including East Lombok Regency. However, there are still 9,434 children aged 7-15 years in the regency who are not attending school, due to factors such as poverty and distance from schools. To address this issue, East Lombok Regency implements the policy of completing 9-year mandatory education, with a focus on encouraging and facilitating out-of-school children, especially those from poor families and girls. The development of one-stop schools and the improvement of the quality of non-formal education services are ongoing efforts.

The importance of building partnerships with various formal and non-formal institutions becomes the main strategy. The regency seeks to collaborate with organizations such as Family Welfare Education, Higher Education, Non-Governmental Organizations, and other government agencies involved in completing 9-year mandatory education. Developing community participation is considered crucial to achieving equitable and quality education

---

<sup>22</sup> Imaddudin Abil Fadha, 'Occupational Therapy Approaches in Supporting Students With Sensory Disorders in Islamic Education', *Dirasab International Journal of Islamic Studies* 2, no. 1 (22 June 2024): 96–105, <https://doi.org/10.59373/drs.v2i1.26>.

<sup>23</sup> Munaya Ulil Ilmi et al., 'The Basic Concepts of Evaluation and Its Implementation in IRE Lessons in The Pandemic Era', *Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education* 2, no. 2 (30 July 2021): 175–90, <https://doi.org/10.31538/tijie.v2i2.50>; Ahmad Asse et al., 'Diversity Problems in Students' Educational Backgrounds and Learning Program Policies of Arabic Language Education', *Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education* 4, no. 4 (2024): 535–46, <https://doi.org/10.31538/tijie.v4i4.701>.

<sup>24</sup> Yulius P. K. Suni and Djoko Legono, 'MANAJEMEN SUMBER DAYA AIR TERPADU DALAM SKALA GLOBAL, NASIONAL DAN REGIONAL', *Jurnal Teknik Sipil* 10, no. 1 (9 July 2021): 77–88; Ahmad Mukhtar B et al., 'The Role of Quality Human Resources in Developing Missions of Future Universities in Indonesian Higher Education', *Munaddhomah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam* 4, no. 1 (14 February 2023): 49–59, <https://doi.org/10.31538/munaddhomah.v4i1.342>; Aneu Nandya Indayanti, Afifah Barkatul Atqiya, and Badrudin Badrudin, 'Education Human Resource Management in the Recruitment of Extraordinary Lecturers', *Munaddhomah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam* 3, no. 2 (2022): 194–202, <https://doi.org/10.31538/munaddhomah.v3i2.262>.

<sup>25</sup> Michael Howlett, 'Moving Policy Implementation Theory Forward: A Multiple Streams/Critical Juncture Approach', *Public Policy and Administration* 34, no. 4 (1 October 2019): 405–30, <https://doi.org/10.1177/0952076718775791>.

access. Therefore, direct socialization as well as through mass media such as local radio, local TV, and print media are continuously enhanced. Data collection systems and quality are also the focus of policies to identify out-of-school children aged 7-15 years.

The Department of Education and Culture of East Lombok Regency has identified strategic steps in implementing this policy. These include improving coordination with various institutions, data collection of out-of-school children, socialization through mass media, optimizing the functions of educational institutions, developing the concept of one-stop schools, providing learning expenses, and developing gender-based education. Additionally, seminars/workshops are held to discuss and evaluate progress and challenges in efforts to complete 9-year mandatory education in East Lombok Regency. All of these steps are expected to accelerate and expand educational access in the region.

### **CONCLUSION**

This study highlights the effectiveness of nine-year compulsory basic education planning in East Lombok Regency with a focus on minimum service standards. The findings show that the planning process has been supported by active participation and transparency of stakeholders. The planning structure has included appropriate budget analysis and allocation, although there are several obstacles such as budget limitations and suboptimal community participation. As a result, improvements in the quality and access to basic education have been achieved, including a decrease in illiteracy rates in the region. This study shows that planning involving multi-stakeholder collaboration has the potential to strengthen government efforts in achieving equal access to education.

Theoretically, this study strengthens the concept of educational planning based on the principle of social justice, by emphasizing that access to education must be equal for all children, especially for those vulnerable to inequality such as children from poor families or remote areas. This theory is in line with the concept of distributive justice which emphasizes the importance of fair resource allocation to achieve equal access to education for all school-age children. In practice, this study provides guidelines to local governments regarding the importance of participatory and transparent planning in developing a nine-year compulsory education program. Collaborative implementation of planning that focuses on clear performance indicators, systematic budget allocation, and community involvement can improve the quality of education services. This study also recommends increasing the capacity of human resources to manage performance-based budgets and involving the private sector in funding.

This study has limitations in the form of suboptimal community participation and the limited availability of longer longitudinal data to measure long-term impacts. In addition, budget constraints are a major challenge in achieving all desired minimum service targets. Further research is recommended to address these limitations by involving broader participation and improving program sustainability through more efficient budget planning.

### **ACKNOWLEDGMENT**

It is used as a thanking expression from authors to official institution or persons that act as a donor, or contribute in the research. It is completed by research letter of contract. Example:



this research is supported by Ministry of Religious Affair through scheme of Research Excellence grant year 2017 number PUIK-2017-123.

## REFERENCES

- Alwi, Musdalifah, and Lusia Mumtahana. 'The Principal's Strategy in Improving the Quality of Teacher Performance in the Learning Process in Islamic Elementary Schools'. *Kharisma: Jurnal Administrasi Dan Manajemen Pendidikan* 2, no. 1 (17 April 2023): 66–78. <https://doi.org/10.59373/kharisma.v2i1.18>.
- Amalia, Lia, and Endah D. A. Anantisari. 'Evaluation of 9-Year Compulsory Basic Education Learning Program in Serang Banten'. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series* 1477, no. 4 (March 2020): 042072. <https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1477/4/042072>.
- Arifin, Zainul, Ayu Desrani, Apri Wardana Ritonga, and Faishol Mahmoud Adam Ibrahim. 'An Innovation in Planning Management for Learning Arabic at Islamic Boarding Schools'. *Nidbomul Haq: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam* 8, no. 1 (4 March 2023): 77–89. <https://doi.org/10.31538/ndh.v8i1.3237>.
- Asse, Ahmad, Fani Fadhila Putri, Titin Fatimah, Nursyam Nursyam, and Didin Faqihuddin. 'Diversity Problems in Students' Educational Backgrounds and Learning Program Policies of Arabic Language Education'. *Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education* 4, no. 4 (2024): 535–46. <https://doi.org/10.31538/tijie.v4i4.701>.
- B, Ahmad Muktamar, Ni Luh Kardini, Aria Elshifa, Susi Adiawaty, and Tri Cicik Wijayanti. 'The Role of Quality Human Resources in Developing Missions of Future Universities in Indonesian Higher Education'. *Munaddhomah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam* 4, no. 1 (14 February 2023): 49–59. <https://doi.org/10.31538/munaddhomah.v4i1.342>.
- Chang, Dian-Fu, Wen-Ching Chou, and Tien-Li Chen. 'Comparing Gender Diversity in the Process of Higher-Education Expansion in Japan, Korea, Taiwan, and the UK for SDG 5'. *Sustainability* 14, no. 17 (January 2022): 10929. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su141710929>.
- Creswell, J. W., and A. L. Garrett. 'The "Movement" of Mixed Methods Research and the Role of Educators'. *South African Journal of Education* 28, no. 3 (2008): 321–33. <https://doi.org/10.15700/saje.v28n3a176>.
- Dereń, Aldona Malgorzata, and Jan Skonieczny. 'Green Intellectual Property as a Strategic Resource in the Sustainable Development of an Organization'. *Sustainability* 14, no. 8 (January 2022): 4758. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su14084758>.
- Dewasiri, N. J., Y. K. B. Weerakoon, and A. A. Azeez. 'Mixed Methods in Finance Research: The Rationale and Research Designs'. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods* 17, no. 1 (1 December 2018): 1609406918801730. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1609406918801730>.
- Encabo-Fernández, Eduardo, Domingo Albarracín-Vivo, and Isabel Jerez-Martínez. 'Evaluative Research on the Critical Thinking of Primary School Students'. *International Journal of Educational Research Open* 4 (1 January 2023): 100249. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedro.2023.100249>.
- Eryılmaz, Ene. 'A critical assessment of John Rawls's Theory of Justice as fairness', 2019. <https://open.metu.edu.tr/handle/11511/43642>.
- Fadha, Imaddudin Abil. 'Occupational Therapy Approaches in Supporting Students With Sensory Disorders in Islamic Education'. *Dirasah International Journal of Islamic Studies* 2, no. 1 (22 June 2024): 96–105. <https://doi.org/10.59373/drs.v2i1.26>.

- Fajry, Fajry, Saipul Annur, and Tutut Handayani. 'Strategi Promosi Prodi Pendidikan Sendratasik Dalam Meningkatkan Jumlah Mahasiswa'. *Munaddhomah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam* 5, no. 1 (2024): 51–60. <https://doi.org/10.31538/munaddhomah.v5i1.728>.
- Fauzi, Imron, and Ari Kartiko. 'Pengaruh Promosi an Produk Terhadap Pengambilan Keputusan Memilih Madrasah'. *Munaddhomah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam* 4, no. 2 (15 April 2023): 242–51. <https://doi.org/10.31538/munaddhomah.v4i2.435>.
- Funk, Kendall D., Hannah L. Paul, and Andrew Q. Philips. 'Point Break: Using Machine Learning to Uncover a Critical Mass in Women's Representation'. *Political Science Research and Methods* 10, no. 2 (April 2022): 372–90. <https://doi.org/10.1017/psrm.2021.51>.
- Gunawan, Gunawan, Muhammad Adyan Simanjuntak, and Siti Marisa. 'Compulsory Education Phenomenon for Islamic Education in Indonesia'. *ALAdzkiya International of Education and Sosial (AIoES) Journal* 3, no. 1 (16 April 2022): 10–17. <https://doi.org/10.55311/aioes.v3i1.183>.
- Hibatulloh, Kiki. 'The Ethics of Islamic Religious Education Teachers According to KH. Hasyim Asy'ari and Their Relevance to Improving the Quality of Islamic Education in Indonesia'. *LECTURES: Journal of Islamic and Education Studies* 1, no. 1 (12 December 2022): 1–9. <https://doi.org/10.58355/lectures.v1i1.12>.
- Howlett, Michael. 'Moving Policy Implementation Theory Forward: A Multiple Streams/Critical Juncture Approach'. *Public Policy and Administration* 34, no. 4 (1 October 2019): 405–30. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0952076718775791>.
- Huda, Miftachul, Muhamad Arif, Mohamad Marzuqi Abdul Rahim, and Muhammad Anshari. 'Islamic Religious Education Learning Media in the Technology Era: A Systematic Literature Review'. *At-Tadzkir: Islamic Education Journal* 3, no. 2 (7 June 2024): 83–103. <https://doi.org/10.59373/attadzkir.v3i2.62>.
- Ilmi, Munaya Ulil, Farid Setiawan, Maulida Nurul Hikmah, Arrum Kharisma, Dimas Feryawan, and Aiman Affan Hanafie. 'The Basic Concepts of Evaluation and Its Implementation in IRE Lessons in The Pandemic Era'. *Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education* 2, no. 2 (30 July 2021): 175–90. <https://doi.org/10.31538/tjje.v2i2.50>.
- Indayanti, Aneu Nandya, Afifah Barkatul Atqiya, and Badrudin Badrudin. 'Education Human Resource Management in the Recruitment of Extraordinary Lecturers'. *Munaddhomah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam* 3, no. 2 (2022): 194–202. <https://doi.org/10.31538/munaddhomah.v3i2.262>.
- Jumiati, Jumiati, and Ari Kartiko. 'Pengaruh Self Efficacy Dan Locus of Control Terhadap Kinerja Guru'. *Academicus: Journal of Teaching and Learning* 1, no. 1 (27 September 2022): 32–44. <https://doi.org/10.59373/academicus.v1i1.5>.
- Karnati, Neti. 'Implementation Strategy of 9-Year Compulsory Basic Education Policy In Serang Banten', 2020. [https://www.academia.edu/61857625/Implementation\\_Strategy\\_of\\_9\\_Year\\_Compulsory\\_Basic\\_Education\\_Policy\\_In\\_Serang\\_Banten?auto=download](https://www.academia.edu/61857625/Implementation_Strategy_of_9_Year_Compulsory_Basic_Education_Policy_In_Serang_Banten?auto=download).
- Karsono, Bambang, Robertus Suraji, and Istianingsih Sastrodiharjo. 'The Influence of Leadership Spirituality to Improving the Quality of Higher Education in Indonesia'. *International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities Invention* 9, no. 02 (22 February 2022): 6832–41. <https://doi.org/10.18535/ijsshi/v9i02.06>.
- Kartiko, Ari, and jaya Roza Azzukhrufi. 'Pengaruh Budaya Organisasi Dan Kompensasi Terhadap Kinerja Pendidik Di Madrasah Aliyah Nahdlatul Ulama Mazro'atul Ulum Paciran'. *Nidbomul Haq: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam* 4, no. 2 (5 September 2019): 207–26. <https://doi.org/10.31538/ndh.v4i2.351>.
- Kartiko, Ari, Guntur Arie Wibowo, Lisda Van Gobel, Adi Wijayanto, and Nanda Saputra. 'Improving Teacher Job Satisfaction Through Organizational Commitment and Organizational Citizenship

- Behavior in The Digitalization Era'. *Nidhomul Haq : Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam* 8, no. 2 (15 October 2023): 315–27. <https://doi.org/10.31538/ndh.v8i2.3960>.
- Kinchin, Ian M. 'The Salutogenic Management of Pedagogic Frailty: A Case of Educational Theory Development Using Concept Mapping'. *Education Sciences* 9, no. 2 (June 2019): 157. <https://doi.org/10.3390/educsci9020157>.
- Kurniawan, Cahyadi, Ulung Pribadi, and Muhammad Iqbal. 'The Role of E-Governance in Improving Local Governments Performance (Case Study: Sumbawa Regency)'. *Jurnal Ilmiah Peuradeun* 11, no. 3 (30 September 2023): 1139–54. <https://doi.org/10.26811/peuradeun.v11i3.795>.
- Mamabolo, Martha Motshaki, Khashane Stephen Malatji, and Lydia Kgomotso Mphahlele. 'The Role of Supervisors in the Implementation of the Integrated Quality Management System in Schools'. *South African Journal of Education* 42, no. 1 (28 February 2022): 1–9. <https://doi.org/10.15700/saje.v42n1a2019>.
- Ma'rufi, Anwar, Saifudin, Khorun Nisa', and Muhajir. 'Burhani Epistemology in The Scientific Development of Contemporary Pesantren'. *Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education* 5, no. 2 (21 April 2024): 301–14. <https://doi.org/10.31538/tijie.v5i2.937>.
- Miles, Matthew B., A. Michael Huberman, and Johnny Saldana. *Qualitative Data Analysis: A Methods Sourcebook*. SAGE Publications, 2013.
- Mukhlis, Maulana, Feni Rosalia, and M. Arif Kurniawan. 'Transfer of Management Authority Policy: A Difficult Path to Educational Decentralization Effectiveness (A Case Study in Pesisir Barat Regency, Lampung Province)'. *International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities Invention* 9, no. 05 (20 May 2022): 7031–41. <https://doi.org/10.18535/ijsshi/v9i05.05>.
- Nicolás-Castellano, Carolina, Rubén Limiñana, Asunción Menargues, Sergio Rosa-Cintas, and Joaquín Martínez-Torregrosa. 'Sustainable Change in Primary Science Education: From Transmissive to Guided Inquiry-Based Teaching'. *Sustainability* 15, no. 15 (January 2023): 11710. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su151511710>.
- Nieminen, Juuso Henrik. 'Assessment for Inclusion: Rethinking Inclusive Assessment in Higher Education'. *Teaching in Higher Education* 29, no. 4 (18 May 2024): 841–59. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13562517.2021.2021395>.
- Pasichnyi, Mykola, Tetiana Kaneva, Maksym Ruban, and Anton Nepytyaliuk. 'The Impact of Fiscal Decentralization on Economic Development'. SSRN Scholarly Paper. Rochester, NY: Social Science Research Network, 11 July 2019. <https://papers.ssrn.com/abstract=3430955>.
- Qasserras, Mohammed. 'Character and Peacebuilding in Islamic Pedagogy, "Tazkiyah" and "Taaruif" Concepts as A Case Study'. *At-Tadzkir: Islamic Education Journal* 3, no. 1 (25 February 2024): 26–34. <https://doi.org/10.59373/attadzkir.v3i1.50>.
- Riani, Susana Siti, and Siti Quratul Ain. 'The Role of School Principal in Implementing Education Quality Management'. *Jurnal Ilmiah Sekolah Dasar* 6, no. 2 (4 June 2022): 204–11. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jisd.v6i2.45216>.
- Rupiarsieh. '9 Year Compulsory Education Evaluation In Bojonegoro Regency, East Java Province, Indonesia. Year 2015'. *Advances in Social Sciences Research Journal* 6, no. 3 (14 March 2019): 39–49. <https://doi.org/10.14738/assrj.63.6280>.
- Sugiyono. *Metode penelitian pendidikan: (pendekatan kuantitatif, kualitatif dan R & D)*. Alfabeta, 2008.
- Suni, Yulius P. K., and Djoko Legono. 'Manajemen Sumber Daya Air Terpadu Dalam Skala Global, Nasional Dan Regional'. *Jurnal Teknik Sipil* 10, no. 1 (9 July 2021): 77–88.
- Yukhong, Chatthida, Thongchai Phuwawatwichit, Charin Mangkhang, and Atchara Sarobol. 'Socialization Concepts and Educational Management Development to Create Muslim Citizenship through Private Islamic Schools in the Southern Border Provinces of Thailand'.

*International Journal of Islamic Thought* 15 (13 June 2019): 27–34.  
<https://doi.org/10.24035/ijit.15.2019.003>.

Yükselbaba, Ülker. 'Can Rawls' Theory of Distributive Justice Become a Cure for Poverty?' *Annales de La Faculté de Droit d'Istanbul*, no. 71 (31 December 2022): 539–65.  
<https://doi.org/10.26650/Annales.2022.71.0010>.